City of Culver City

Mike Balkman Council Chambers
9770 Culver Blvd.
Culver City, CA 90232

Staff Report

File #: 20-487, **Version:** 1 **Item #:** C-5.

CC - (1) Adoption of a Resolution Establishing Specific Locations for the Installation of Parking Meters Within the City's Parking Meter Zones, Including New Meters on Various Commercial Streets, and on the Commercial Segments Generally between the Alleys and Commercial Streets, and Rescinding Resolution Number 2016-R009; (2) Direction to the Public Works Director/City Engineer to Install Parking Meters in Such Locations; (3) Approval of Related Agreements and Purchases Orders for the Installation of New Meters and Upgrading of Existing Meters; and (4) Direction to the Public Works Director/City Engineer regarding the Metered Public Parking Spaces in the Lucky Development Project Located at 12821 West Washington Boulevard.

Meeting Date: November 18, 2019

Contact Person/Dept: Gabe Garcia/Public Works Department

Phone Number: (310) 253-5633

Fiscal Impact: Yes [X] No [] **General Fund:** Yes [X] No []

Public Hearing: [] **Action Item:** [X] **Attachments:** [X]

Commission Action Required: Yes [] No [X] **Date:**

Public Notification: (Email) Agenda and Meetings - City Council (11/13/19); (E-Mail) Chamber of Commerce (11/13/19); (Courtesy Notice Advertisement) Culver City News (11/14/19); and (Mail) Property Owners, Business Owners, and Residents Immediately Adjacent to the proposed installation locations

Department Approval: Charles D. Herbertson, PW Director/City Engineer (11/07/19)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the City Council (1) adopt a resolution establishing specific locations for the installation of parking meters within the City's parking meter zones, including new meters on various commercial streets, and on the commercial segments generally between the alleys and commercial streets, and rescinding Resolution Number 2016-R009; (2) direct the Public Works Director/City Engineer to install parking meters in such locations; (3) approve related agreements and purchase orders for the installation of new meters and upgrading of existing meters; and (4) provide direction to the Public Works Director/City Engineer regarding the metered public parking spaces in the Lucky Development Project located at 12821 West Washington Boulevard (former site of the Baldwin

Motel).

BACKGROUND/DISCUSSION

In January 2011, staff presented to the City Council proposed objectives and policies to guide the future installation of parking meters. The policy direction received from the City Council was to install parking meters on all business/commercial/industrial streets, except at places of worship, schools, State and Federal government facilities, and residential frontages (except when any of these exempted places request parking meters in writing). For staff to install parking meters at specific locations, the explicit authorization from the City Council is necessary by adoption of a Resolution.

Since 2011, staff has annually installed additional smart meters. There are currently 2,045 smart meters in place. In continuing the implementation of the policy direction received from the City Council to install parking meters on all business/commercial/industrial streets, staff proposes the installation of smart parking meters on identified streets throughout the City.

Installation of New Parking Meters Owned by the City, as well as Purchase and Installation of New Pay Stations

The City owns approximately 558 new single-space smart parking meters that have not yet been installed from a previous City Council-authorized purchase. Staff proposes the installation of these smart parking meters.

Additionally, this report proposes the purchase of 30 smart multi-space parking meters (pay stations) to replace existing old pay stations, as well as install the pay stations at select locations. A more detailed description is provided in later sections of this report.

Parking Meter Time Limits

The time restrictions of parking meters are set based on the adjacent business needs, such as 30 -minute (supplemented with green curbs), 2-hour and 10-hour parking time limits. The meters are in operation Monday through Saturday from 8 am to 6 pm (to 8 pm in Downtown). All new single-space meter installations are proposed to conform to the existing hours of operation.

Staff proposes that all new parking meter installations be set to a 2-hour time-limit as a default. However, as with previous meter installation projects, staff will work with the businesses on a block-by-block basis to determine the best time-limit (such as 30-minutes for retail facilities, or 10-hours when employee parking is needed) to accommodate the needs of the majority of businesses on the block, as represented by a super majority of 75% of the businesses in a petition. This process has been successful in previous installations with the most recent installation in the Arts District. Where existing parking time limits are currently posted, the same time limits will be implemented in the parking meters, unless the business block requests a change by the petition process previously described. If the City Council approves moving forward with this round of installation, staff will continue to work with businesses in this regard.

Parking Meter Rate

The City Council has adopted several parking meter rates, and the adopted rates will be implemented during this meter installation. The adopted rates are as follows:

- Outside of the Downtown area, the rate is $1 per hour;
- In the Downtown area, $1.50 per hour;
- At 30-minute time-limit meters, $1 per hour ($1.50 in Downtown);
- At 15-minute time-limit meters that primarily serve restaurant take-out and quick business stops, $0.75 for 15 minutes;
- At 10-hour meters that serve employee parking in areas with employee parking deficiency, $0.25 per hour (when paid with a credit card, a minimum purchase of two hours is required in order to for the City to cover third party credit card fees and meter vendor processing fees).

It should be noted that the hourly rates in public parking structures and other off-street parking spaces* are interconnected with the metered parking rates on public streets. The hourly rate for parking on public streets should always be higher than the hourly rate for parking in the parking structures and other off-street parking spaces. Otherwise more convenient street parking will have higher occupancy than in parking structures, which could have adverse impacts on adjacent businesses since it would be less costly to park in the more convenient curb-side parking spaces. As the rates for public parking structures and other off-street parking locations are increased, the rates should concurrently be changed for on-street metered parking in order to work towards the occupancy rates targeted by the City.

* The City has control over some parking spaces located in private developments, such as at the Culver City Access and The Culver Steps. In addition, after completion later this calendar year, there will be metered public parking spaces at The Lucky Project, located at 12821 West Washington Boulevard (former site of the Baldwin Motel), adjacent to the 99 Cent store site.

Streets Where New Single-Space Parking Meters Are Proposed

Approximately 558 new single-space smart parking meters are proposed at the following locations, and are included in the attached proposed Resolution (new parking meter locations are identified in **bold text** in the Resolution):

1. Albright Avenue, east side only, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 3 spaces;
2. Alla Road, east side only, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 2 spaces;
3. Alla Road, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 5 spaces;

4. Atlantic Avenue (west intersection), from Washington Boulevard to the southern terminus of residential development, 5 spaces;

5. Atlantic Avenue (east intersection), west side only, from Washington Boulevard to the southern terminus of residential development, 3 spaces;

6. Berryman Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 6 spaces;

7. Berryman Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the city boundary south of Washington Boulevard, 3 spaces;

8. Beethoven Street, east side only, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 3 spaces;

9. Beethoven Street, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 7 spaces;

10. Boise Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 6 spaces;

11. Bledsoe Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 7 spaces;

12. Campbell Drive, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 6 spaces;

13. Chase Avenue, east side only, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 4 spaces;

14. Centinela Avenue, between Green Valley Circle and Bristol Parkway, 30 spaces;

15. Colonial Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 2 spaces;

16. Coolidge Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the city boundary south of Washington Boulevard, 8 spaces;

17. Duquesne Avenue, from Culver Boulevard south to the northern terminus with residential development, 6 spaces;

18. East Boulevard, west side only, from Washington Boulevard to the southern terminus of residential development, 2 spaces;

19. Eastham Drive, between Higuera Street and Warner Drive, 31 spaces;

20. Eastham Drive, between Warner Drive and Steller Drive, 42 spaces;

21. Eastham Drive, east side only, between Steller Drive and the commencement of private property, 6 spaces;

22. Glencoe Avenue, west side only, from Washington Boulevard to Zanja Street, 20 spaces;

23. Grand View Boulevard, west side only, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 4 spaces;

24. Grand View Boulevard, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 9 spaces;

25. Hayden Avenue, from Higuera Street to Warner Drive, 8 spaces;

26. Hayden Avenue, from Warner Drive to Steller Drive, 27 spaces;

27. Hayden Avenue, from Steller Drive to National Boulevard, 38 spaces;

28. Huntley Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 6 spaces;

29. Janisann Avenue, from Sepulveda Boulevard to the alley south separating residential development, 7 spaces;

30. Kenyon Avenue, east side only, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 3 spaces;

31. Lindblade Street, from Washington Boulevard to the south of Washington Boulevard, 5 spaces;

32. Louise Avenue, west side only, from Washington Boulevard to the city boundary south of Washington Boulevard, 4 spaces;

33. Lyceum Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 7 spaces;

34. Lyceum Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 8 spaces;

35. McConnel Boulevard, from Washington Boulevard to the northern terminus of residential development, 6 spaces;

36. McLaughlin Avenue, east side only, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 2 spaces;

37. McLaughlin Avenue, west side only, from Washington Boulevard to the city boundary line south of Washington Boulevard, 3 spaces;

38. Meier Street, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 4

spaces;

39. Meier Street, west side only, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 2 spaces;

40. Michael Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 4 spaces;

41. Michael Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 6 spaces;

42. Mildred Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the northern terminus of residential development, 6 spaces;

43. Minerva Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 7 spaces;

44. Moore Street, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 2 spaces;

45. Moore Street, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 6 spaces;

46. Neosho Avenue, west side, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 2 spaces;

47. Purdue Avenue, west side only, from Washington Boulevard to the city boundary south of Washington Boulevard, 4 spaces;

48. Rosabell Street, from Washington Boulevard to the south to residential boundary, 4 spaces;

49. Stellar Drive, between Eastham Drive and Hayden Avenue, 72 spaces;

50. Tivoli Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 5 spaces;

51. Tivoli Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley south of Washington Boulevard, 7 spaces;

52. Walgrove Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 2 spaces

53. Warner Drive, between Eastham Drive and Hayden Avenue, 77 spaces; and,

54. Wasatch Avenue, from Washington Boulevard to the alley north of Washington Boulevard, 4 spaces.

Of these 558 parking meters, approximately 522 are located either on side streets around the

corner from arterial streets, or on streets with businesses that have on-site employee parking deficiency. Therefore, following previous practice, staff recommends that these 522 spaces be metered for 10-hour parking to accommodate employee parking demand at the present rate of $0.25 per hour. This continues the practice started with the Arts District meter installation. The proposed time-limit and rate will encourage employee parking on these segments of the side streets and free-up parking spaces on the adjacent arterial streets for customer parking at the present rate of $1 per hour.

The 558 parking spaces listed above is an estimate and is based on staff's preliminary field survey. However, during installation, some adjustments to the count may be necessary due to the layout of parking spaces being affected by the presence of utility meters, catch basins, trees, street light and power poles, street furniture, and proximity to driveways. Adjustments in the field during installation may result in an increase or a decrease of the total number indicated. Based on staff's experience, this is an infrequent occurrence, but in some segments the gain or loss of one or two parking spaces may occur.

REQUEST TO PURCHASE AND INSTALL NEW IPS PAY STATIONS

In October of 2011, Duncan Solutions, Inc., submitted a competitive proposal to the City for the purchase of 14 Duncan Solutions' pay stations, in the amount of $186,325.55. The City purchased the pay stations and Duncan Solutions installed them on Sepulveda Boulevard between Culver Boulevard and the city boundary, as well as in the parking lot adjacent to A-Frame Restaurant. In 2017 Duncan Solutions was acquired by another firm and was restructured into two different firms. Over the last couple of years, the pay stations have required significant maintenance and were finally turned off in September 2019 due to the high failure rates beyond what staff could repair. It should be noted that the units are beyond the warranty period and in staff's judgment, they have reached the end of their useful life. Prior to turning off the pay stations, parking enforcement of meter violations was not possible due to their frequent disrepair.

Staff proposes that 30 new IPS pay stations be purchased to replace the inoperable Duncan pay stations. IPS is the manufacturer of the existing single-space smart meters installed citywide. Staff recommends the City Council authorize the purchase of 30 new IPS pay stations, to be installed at the following locations:

To Replace Existing Inoperable Pay Stations

- 12 stations on Sepulveda Boulevard (8 on the west side and 4 on the east side), to replace the now inoperable Duncan pay stations. Due to the absence of pay stations on Sepulveda Boulevard, parking turn-over required for business viability cannot be ensured without metering parking. This is in addition to the revenue loss;

- 1 station in the public parking lot immediately west of A-Frame Restaurant;

To Replace Existing Single-space Meters to Comply with ADA Requirements

- 6 stations on National Boulevard, between Hayden Avenue and Eastham Drive, along an approximate distance of 800 feet to replace 29 existing single-space parking

meters that have caused accessibility concerns due to the narrow sidewalk and are in conflict with our mobility goals;

To Meter Currently Unmetered Parking Spaces

- 1 station on the north side of Culver Boulevard, immediately east of Main Street. This station will serve 4 parking spaces where single-space meters cannot be installed due to landscaping planters and narrow widths;

- 9 stations on Hayden Place, between Higuera Street and the cul-de-sac. The stations will serve 103 parking spaces where meters cannot be installed due to narrow sidewalks; and,

- 1 spare, in case of knock-downs or severe disrepair

PUBLIC PARKING METERS AT THE LUCKY PROJECT (FORMER BALDWIN MOTEL SITE)

Staff is also requesting the City Council consider and provide direction regarding staff's recommended guidelines (discussed further below) to coordinate the operation of new metered public parking spaces to be installed through a public benefit easement, required by project conditions of approval, at the private development of The Lucky. This will also assist in setting a standard process for operation of public parking spaces in private developments.

The Lucky Project, a private mixed-use development project located at 12821 West Washington Boulevard (west of the 99 Cent Store site) will have a total of 34 parking spaces on the ground level. Of the 34 parking spaces, The Lucky will provide 21 public parking spaces (one of which is a handicap parking space), as stipulated by an easement agreement benefitting the City. The remaining 13 parking spaces belong to the developer (one of which is a handicap parking space). The building's hours of operation are planned to be from 6 AM to 11 PM daily. The parking garage will be closed from 11 PM to 6 AM via roll-down gates and not available for use.

All of the spaces, with the exception of the accessible spaces, on the ground level will be metered. This is to facilitate the public's use of the parking spaces without concern over whether they are occupying City's or developer's spaces. City staff, with the concurrence of the developer, recommend the City Council consider the following:

1. That the hours of operation for the 20 metered public parking spaces (the accessible parking space will not be metered) be the same as the building's hours of operation of 6:00 AM to 11:00 PM. This exceeds the typical citywide meter hours of operation from 8 AM to 6 PM (till 8 PM in Downtown);

2. That the rate for parking be set at $1 per hour and adjusted as the City Council adjusts rates from time-to-time, and that the time limit be the duration of the hours of operation with the first hour of parking being free similar to practice in the City's public parking structures;

3. That all 32 metered parking spaces be numbered sequentially independent of the beneficiary of the revenue from the parking spaces (whether City or developer) and metered

by a single pay station to be located in a strategic and convenient location. Users will be directed to the pay station by posted signage;

4. That enforcement of violations at all 34 parking spaces in conformance with state law and the Culver City Municipal Code be provided by the Police Department during the hours of operation contingent upon the required signage, at the developer's cost;

5. That the revenue for all 32 metered parking spaces be collected by the City and tracked by parking space number via the meter vendor's back office management system, and that the revenue for the developer's 12 metered parking spaces be forwarded by the City at an interval to be determined with the Finance Department but no less than quarterly; and,

6. The developer would pay their proportional fair share of the ongoing meter vendor fees charged for the pay station's communication, data management, and credit card transactions fees as a deduction from the collected revenue. The developer would also pay a proportional share of any future expenses for the meter pay station, such as maintenance and repair or replacement of the pay station. It should be noted that the developer has already purchased the meter pay station, as a project condition of approval and will provide electrical power to the unit.

The above reflects the agreement between the City and the developer, as recorded in the Disposition and Development Agreement, and in the recorded Parking Easement Agreement.

Having public parking spaces in private developments creates a unique situation for managing parking for all involved. Staff believes that the aforementioned steps are reasonable and recommends the City Council authorize staff to pursue continued collaboration with the developer. Staff also requests the City Council authorize the City Manager to sign any necessary agreements to implement the above plan, or the intent of the plan where details may be unforeseen at this time.

COMMUNITY OUTREACH

Community notification prior to installation of the parking meters will be conducted by targeted mailing of notices to property owners, business owners, and residents immediately adjacent to the proposed meter locations. When necessary in the judgment of staff, community meetings may be held with targeted groups or impacted geographic areas. Based on past experience, the petition process previously described in this report has successfully addressed all issues of meter time limits when the majority of the businesses' need for time limits has been different than the 2-hour default. Therefore, staff will continue to work with businesses on a block-by-block basis for the purpose of setting the time limit that best fits the needs.

INSTALLATION TIMELINE

If the City Council authorizes the purchase and installation of the pay stations, purchase and installation of the meter posts, installation of the existing meters, and installation of related signage, it is estimated that the project will start in the first quarter of 2020 and be completed by the end of the calendar year.

COMPETITIVE BIDDING REQUIREMENTS DO NOT APPLY

Section 3.07.055.B of the Culver City Municipal Code provides that the requirement for formal competitive bidding does not apply "when the equipment is a component for equipment or a system of equipment previously acquired by the City, and is necessary to repair, maintain or improve the City's utilization of the equipment."

FISCAL ANALYSIS

Single-Space Smart Meters

In 2018, the revenue from the IPS smart meters was $1,741,776.08. On the average, each new smart parking meter has an annual revenue of approximately $800. This is a conservative estimate given that not all of the existing 2,045 meters where operational all of 2018. Based on 2017 figures, the annual revenue per meter was approximately $1,000.

Staff estimates that the 558 new single-space metered parking spaces and the new 106 multi-space metered parking spaces, will generate from $500,000 to $600,000 in additional annual parking revenue.

The project's costs are as follows:

The City already owns the 558 IPS single-space smart parking meters proposed for installation. The cost for installation of the single-space parking meters by IPS technicians is anticipated to be approximately $24 per meter for a total of approximately $13,392.

The smart meters are equipped with e-locks that can be programmed to allow collection on a secure basis as determined by the Police Department's parking revenue collection supervisor. The e-locks require programming one-by-one and data entry into a computerized management system. Although the process can be laborious, the security realized surpasses that of traditional parking meter keys. Similar to traditional meter keys, when an e-lock malfunctions, it is required to be drilled out. All the services required to implement the e-lock system for the 558 meters can be provided by IPS for a six-month period at a cost of $40,000. This will allow the Police Department parking meter staff to focus on collection of revenue rather than on data entry, and Public Works' Maintenance Operations meter staff to focus on maintaining a healthy parking meter supply rather than troubleshooting and fixing e-locks. Trouble shooting issues that may arise is likely to diminish after the first six months, at which time City staff will take-on full responsibility of maintaining the new meters.

Installation of new meter posts in adherence to the City Engineer's standards including the provision of a sleeve that fit over the installed posts to prevent vandalism is estimated to cost approximately $62,775. Staff recommends that James Oh, the same contractor who successfully completed the previous Arts District meter post installation, be awarded the contract for this project.

Staff anticipates that new signage will be required with an approximate cost of $18,000.

Total cost for the single-space smart meter installation component of this project is $134,167.

Multi-space Meters (Pay Stations)

Each IPS multi-space pay station is estimated to cost $8,408.25 including installation, freight, and sales tax. The total cost for the multi-space pay stations is $252,247.50.

Based on the aforementioned information, the total cost estimate for establishment of the outlined single-space and multi-space parking meters is $386,414.50 ($134,167 + $252,247.50).

Proposed Project Budget: PZ-949 has available funds in the amount of: $720,466.37.

There is sufficient funding available in PZ-949 New Parking Meter CIP to pay for this project's purchases, installations and initial maintenance. The ongoing costs will be paid from the parking meter operations fund (10160260 - Parking Meter Maintenance), and there is adequate funding to pay for the cost during this fiscal year. The Public Works Department will incorporate the recurring costs and maintenance in future budget requests.

Ongoing Costs

The IPS smart meters and pay stations communicate wirelessly with the network servers for reporting of transactions data with the City meter maintenance staff, with the meter revenue collection staff, and with the credit card processing services. Additionally, a web-based parking meter management software is provided by IPS to manage the meters and run maintenance and other reports.

These services represent an on-going cost of $8 per single-space meter per month, or $4,464 per month when all 558 meters are installed. The annual ongoing cost for these meters when all are installed is anticipated to be $53,568.

For the multi-space pay stations, the ongoing cost is $55 per unit per month, or $1,650 for the 30 units at an annual anticipated cost of $19,800.

Additionally, the City pays a fee of $0.06 per credit card transaction to IPS, and two types of fees to its merchant bank for each credit card transaction as described below.

A) The average monthly fee paid to IPS for credit card transactions is approximately $4,000, or $48,000 per year;

B) The fees paid by the City to our own merchant bank are: 1) a flat fee of $0.17 per transaction; and 2) a fee of $0.02 multiplied by the amount of transactions. The total amount of fees for credit card transactions paid by the City to its merchant bank cannot be accurately projected due to the variation of parking meter payments. However, based on past data, the average fee per parking meter transaction is approximately $0.20. It is difficult to estimate an accurate monthly or yearly fee.

ATTACHMENTS

1. 2019-11-18_ATT - Resolution Authorizing Installation of Meters

MOTION

That the City Council:

1. Adopt a Resolution establishing specific locations for the installation of parking meters on commercial streets and commercial segments of other streets and rescinding Resolution No. 2016-R009;

2. Direct the Public Works Director/City Engineer to install parking meters in such locations;

3. Approve an agreement with IPS Group, Inc., to install up to 558 City-owned new smart parking meters, in an amount not to exceed $13,392, to be paid from PZ-949 New Parking Meter project;

4. Approve an agreement with IPS Group, Inc., to provide e-lock installation, setup, programming, and maintenance for a period of six months in an amount not to exceed $40,000 to be paid from PZ-949 New Parking Meter project;

5. Approve an agreement with James Oh Construction, to provide and install up to 419 parking meter posts, in an amount not to exceed $62,775 to be paid from PZ-949 New Parking Meter project;

6. Approve a purchase order with IPS Group, Inc. for the purchase of 30 multi-space pay stations (model MS1) with Medeco electronic lock, electronic vault, and large sealed coin box, in an amount not to exceed $252,247.50 to be paid from PZ-949 New Parking Meter project;

7. Authorize the purchase of signs in an amount not to exceed $18,000 from a vendor to be selected by staff pursuant to City procedures to be paid from PZ-949 New Parking Meter project;

8. Authorize the Purchasing Officer to approve the purchase order(s);

9. Authorize the City Attorney to review/prepare the necessary documents;

10. Authorize the City Manager to execute such documents on behalf of the City; and

11. Authorize the City Manager to implement the management of parking in The Lucky development project as generally described in this staff report, and to execute any related agreements.