ORDINANCE NO. 2019-

2

1

3

4

5

6

7 8

9

10 11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18 19

20 21

22

23 24

25

26 27

28

ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CULVER CITY, **PROVISIONS** CERTAIN CALIFORNIA. AMENDING CHAPTER 11.15, TOBACCO RETAILER LICENSING, OF THE CULVER CITY MUNICIPAL TO PROHIBIT THE SALE OF FLAVORED TOBACCO PRODUCTS, INCLUDING MENTHOL.

WHEREAS, tobacco use remains a significant public health problem and impediment to health equity in California and the United States. Each year, tobaccorelated diseases cause the deaths of approximately 40,000 Californians and nearly half a million individuals in the United States, making tobacco use the nation's leading cause of preventable death.¹ For decades, governments at the federal, state, and local levels have advanced various policies intended to address this significant public health crisis; and

WHEREAS, in 2009, the Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act ("Tobacco Control Act") gave the U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA) the authority to regulate tobacco products. The legislation also prohibited cigarettes that contain artificial or natural flavors (except tobacco or menthol) or an herb or spice, including strawberry, grape, orange, clove, cinnamon, pineapple, vanilla, coconut, licorice, cocoa, chocolate, cherry, or coffee, that is a characterizing flavor of the tobacco product ("characterizing flavor") to minimize the attractiveness of tobacco products to youth; and

WHEREAS, the Tobacco Control Act also established the Tobacco Products Scientific Advisory Committee (TPSAC), which was charged with developing a report assessing the impact of the use of menthol in cigarettes on public health and proposing recommendations to the FDA on whether menthol should be banned or not. The TPSAC report and recommendations were submitted to the FDA on March 18, 2011 and the report

¹ Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Best Practices for Comprehensive Tobacco Control Programs—2014. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Office on Smoking and Health, 2014, Available at:

https://www.cdc.gov/tobacco/stateandcommunity/best_practices/pdfs/2014/comprehensive.pdf.

found that the availability of menthol cigarettes has an adverse impact on public health in the United States and recommended removal of menthol cigarettes from the marketplace; and

WHEREAS, notwithstanding the TPSAC report, the FDA has not banned menthol products nor flavored non-cigarette tobacco products, such as cigars, cigarillos, smokeless tobacco, hookah tobacco and electronic smoking devices ("E-Cigarettes") and the nicotine solutions used in these devices. Currently California law also does not restrict the sales of these products; and

WHEREAS, states and local governments have developed educational programs and media campaigns on the risks of tobacco use, offered resources to help tobacco users quit, increased excise taxes on cigarettes and other tobacco products, and adopted restrictions on the sale and use of tobacco products. Although these policies have reduced the use of tobacco products, recent estimates suggest that 441,000 Californians under 18 today will die from tobacco-related diseases²; and

WHEREAS, flavored tobacco products are considered "starter" products that help establish long-term tobacco use, and they are particularly appealing to youth and young adults³; and

WHEREAS, the California Department of Public Health (CDPH) has published informational bulletins *The Truth About Flavored Tobacco*⁴ and *Flavored*

² Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. *Best Practices for Comprehensive Tobacco Control Programs—2014.* U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Office on Smoking and Health. 2014. Available at:

https://www.cdc.gov/tobacco/stateandcommunity/best_practices/pdfs/2014/comprehensive.pdf.

3U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Preventing Tobacco Use Among Youth and Young Adults:

A Report of the Surgeon General. Atlanta, GA: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Office on Smoking and Health. 2012. Available at: https://www.surgeongeneral.gov/library/reports/preventing-youth-tobacco-use/

⁴ California Department of Public Health. *The Truth About Flavored Tobacco* – 2018. Available at: https://www.cdph.ca.gov/Programs/CCDPHP/DCDIC/CTCB/CDPH%20Document%20Library/Policy/FlavoredTobaccoInfographic.pdf

flavors in E-Cigarettes, including: sweet flavors (e.g. watermelon, cherry, chocolate, mint and gummy bear) appeal to kids and teens; flavorings mask the harsh taste of tobacco, making it easier for youth to initiate tobacco use; current marketing of flavored tobacco products is targeted at youth (i.e. marketing products similar to popular candy brands, such as Jolly Rancher, Kool-Aid and Life Savers; and colorful packaging and smaller, low costs packages available for purchase); serious health risks from nicotine and flavored e-liquids; and flavoring chemicals in E-Cigarettes have been linked to severe respiratory disease; and

Tobacco Products Fact Sheet⁵, which discuss many of the issues relating to the use of

WHEREAS, as with other flavors, menthol appeals to young and beginning smokers and makes it harder to quit smoking, according to the CDPH's information bulletin *The Truth About Menthol Cigarettes.*⁶ CDPH has also found menthol is easier to inhale and allows smokers to inhale more deeply, which causes harmful particles to settle deeper inside the lungs. According to CDPH and the scientific community, in addition to the impacts of menthol products on the youth population, there appears to be a disproportionate marketing of menthol flavors to, and use by, minority groups, including African Americans and LGB communities, as evidenced by the following:⁷ among adult smokers in California, 18% of white cigarette smokers smoke menthol cigarettes, whereas 70% of African American cigarette smokers use menthol; almost 50% of LGB smokers use menthol cigarettes compared to 28% of straight smokers; among Hispanic/Latino current adult smokers in the US, 46% smoke menthol cigarettes; among Hispanic/Latino young adult current smokers (aged 18-25) in the US from 2008 to 2010, 47.3% smoked menthol cigarettes; between 2008-2010 and 2012-2014, the largest increase in menthol cigarette

⁵ California Department of Public Health. *Flavored Tobacco Products Fact Sheet* - 2016. Available at: https://www.cdph.ca.gov/Programs/CCDPHP/DCDIC/CTCB/CDPH%20Document%20Library/ResearchandEvaluation/FactsandFigures/FinalFlavoredTobaccoFactSheet.pdf

⁶ California Department of Public Health. The Truth About Menthol Cigarettes - 2018. Available at: https://www.cdph.ca.gov/Programs/CCDPHP/DCDIC/CTCB/CDPH%20Document%20Library/Policy/FlavoredTobaccoAndMenthol/FinalMentholInfographic.pdf

⁷ Keck School of Medicine of USC, Flavor and Menthol Tobacco Products and E-cigarettes, May 22, 2019.

use among race/ethnic groups was in found in Hispanic smokers (rising 9.8%); and studies have shown negative associations among menthol cigarette use and successful cessation in Hispanic communities; and

WHEREAS, according to data from the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC): in 2011 less than 2% of high school students (220,000) reported using E-Cigarettes; in 2018, three million (3,000,000) high school students reported being current users, a rise of 78% from the previous year; also in 2018, about 5% of middle school students (570,000) reported using E-Cigarettes, a rise of 48% from the prior year⁸; and 80% of young people who have ever used tobacco started with a flavored product⁹; and

WHEREAS, data from the California Healthy Kids survey found that 14% of 11th graders at Culver City High School reported current E-Cigarette use. Reports from teachers at the middle school cite a growing number of middle schoolers using E-Cigarettes. Data from the survey of Culver City students found that almost 70% of 9th and 11th graders thought that E-Cigarettes were easy to obtain, and approximately 1 out of 4 thought that E-Cigarettes posed little health risk; 10 and

WHEREAS, the City Council of the City of Culver City recognizes that young people are particularly susceptible to the addictive properties of tobacco products, and are particularly likely to become lifelong users; and

WHEREAS, it is the intent of the City Council of the City of Culver City to provide for the public's health, safety, and welfare in part by protecting youth from commencing the inherently dangerous activity of smoking, and protecting the public health and safety of the general public; and

⁸ Notes from the Field: Use of Electronic Cigarettes and Any Tobacco Product Among Middle and High School Students — United States, 2011–2018 MMWR Weekly/November 16, 2018 / 67(45);1276–1277 https://www.cdc.gov/mmwr/volumes/67/wr/mm6745a5.htm?s_cid=mm6745a5_e

⁹ Truth Initiative, 3/16/17. Widespread use of flavored products in young tobacco users. Available: https://truthinitiative.org/research/widespread-use-flavored-products-young-tobacco-users

¹⁰ City Unified School District. California Healthy Kids Survey, 2018-19: Main Report. San Francisco: WestEd Health and Justice Program for the California Department of Education.

WHEREAS, the City Council of the City of Culver City finds the failure of tobacco retailers to comply with all tobacco control laws, particularly laws prohibiting the sale of tobacco products to persons under 21 years of age, presents a threat to the community's public health, safety and welfare; and

whereas, the City Council desires to encourage responsible tobacco retailing and to discourage violations of tobacco-related laws, especially those which prohibit or discourage the sale or distribution of tobacco products to persons under 21 years of age; and

WHEREAS, the City Council desires to amend certain provisions of its existing tobacco retailer licensing regulations to prohibit the sale of flavored tobacco products, including menthol, to further protect the community's public health, safety and welfare: and

WHEREAS, the City Council hereby declares that the intent and purpose of the proposed amendment to Chapter 11.15 of the Culver City Municipal Code, to prohibit the sale of flavored tobacco products, including menthol, is to further protect the public health, safety, and welfare and, in particular to protect children from being lured into illegal activity through the misconduct of adults.

NOW THEREFORE, the City Council of the City of Culver City, California,

DOES HEREBY ORDAIN as follows:

SECTION 1. Section 11.15.005 of Chapter 11.15 of the Culver City Municipal Code is hereby amended to read as follows (<u>underlined text</u> denotes additions; strikethrough text denotes deletions):

§ 11.15.005 PURPOSE.

In promoting the health, safety, and general welfare of its residents, the City of Culver City has a substantial interest in encouraging compliance with federal,

-5-

State, and local laws regulating tobacco sales and use; discouraging the purchase and use of tobacco products by youth; increasing compliance with laws prohibiting the sale of tobacco products to youth; and in protecting children from being lured into illegal activity through the misconduct of adults. In enacting this Chapter, it is the intent of the City Council of the City of Culver City to encourage responsible tobacco retailing and to discourage violations of tobacco-related laws, especially those that prohibit or discourage the sale or distribution of tobacco and nicotine product to minors youth, but not to expand or reduce the degree to which the acts regulated by federal or State law are criminally proscribed or otherwise regulated.

SECTION 2. Section 11.15.010 of Chapter 11.15 of the Culver City Municipal Code is hereby amended to read as follows (<u>underlined text</u> denotes additions; strikethrough text denotes deletions):

§ 11.15.010 DEFINITIONS.

For the purposes of this Chapter, the following definitions shall apply unless the context clearly indicates or requires a different meaning.

CHARACTERIZING FLAVOR. A taste or aroma, other than the taste or aroma of tobacco, imparted either prior to or during consumption of a Tobacco Product or any byproduct produced by the Tobacco Product, including, but not limited to, tastes or aromas relating to menthol, mint, wintergreen, fruit, chocolate, vanilla, honey, candy, cocoa, dessert, alcoholic beverage, herb, or spice; provided, however, that a Tobacco Product shall not be determined to have a Characterizing Flavor solely because of the use of additives or flavorings or the provision of ingredient information.

CONSUMER. A Person who purchases a Tobacco Product for consumption and not for Sale to another.

DEPARTMENT. The Finance Department of the City of Culver City.

ELECTRONIC SMOKING DEVICE. An electronic device that can be used to deliver an inhaled dose of nicotine, or other substances, including any component, part, or accessory of such a device, whether or not sold separately. Electronic Smoking Device includes any such device, whether manufactured, distributed, marketed, or sold as an electronic cigarette, an electronic cigar, an electronic cigarillo, an electronic pipe, an electronic hookah, or any other product name or descriptor.

ELECTRONIC SMOKING DEVICE PARAPHERNALIA. Cartridges, cartomizers, e-liquid, smoke juice, tips, atomizers, Electronic Smoking Device batteries, Electronic Smoking Device chargers, and any other item specifically designed for the preparation, charging, or use of Electronic Smoking Devices.

<u>FLAVORED TOBACCO PRODUCT:</u> Any Tobacco Product that imparts a Characterizing Flavor.

LABELING. Written, printed, or graphic matter upon any Tobacco Product or any of its Packaging, or accompanying such Tobacco Product.

entirely or in part in tobacco or any substance containing tobacco and weighing no more than three pounds per thousand. "Little Cigar" includes, but is not limited to, Tobacco Products known or labeled as small cigar, little cigar, or cigarillo.

MANUFACTURER. Any Person, including any repacker or relabeler, who manufactures, fabricates, assembles, processes, or labels a Tobacco Product; or imports a finished Tobacco Product for sale or distribution into the United States.

<u>PACKAGE or PACKAGING.</u> A pack, box, carton, or container of any kind or, if no other container, any wrapping (including cellophane) in which a Tobacco Product is Sold or offered for Sale to a Consumer.

PERSON. Any natural person, partnership, cooperative association, corporation, personal representative, receiver, trustee, assignee, or any other legal entity.

PROPRIETOR. A person with an ownership or managerial interest in a business. An ownership interest shall be deemed to exist when a person has a ten percent (10%) or greater interest in the stock, assets, or income of a business other than the sole interest of security for debt. A managerial interest shall be deemed to exist when a person can or does have or share ultimate control over the day-to-day operations of a business.

<u>SALE</u> or <u>SELL</u>. Any transfer, exchange, barter, gift, offer for sale, or <u>distribution</u> for a commercial purpose, in any manner or by any means whatsoever.

SELF-SERVICE DISPLAY. The open display of Tobacco Products or Tobacco Paraphernalia in a manner that is physically accessible in any way to the general public without the assistance of the Tobacco Retailer or employee of the Tobacco Retailer and a direct person-to-person transfer between the purchaser and the Tobacco Retailer or employee of the Tobacco Retailer. A Vending Machine is a form of Self-Service Display.

the consumption, use, or preparation of Tobacco Products. "Tobacco Paraphernalia" includes Electronic Smoking Device Paraphernalia. Cigarette papers or wrappers, pipes, holders of smoking materials of all types, cigarette rolling machines, and any other instrument or paraphernalia designed for the smoking, preparation, storing, ingestion or consumption of Tobacco Products. For purposes of this Chapter, Tobacco Paraphernalia includes an Electronic Smoking Device and Electronic Smoking Device Paraphernalia.

TOBACCO PRODUCT.

- 1. Any product containing, made, or derived from tobacco or nicotine that is intended for human consumption, whether smoked, heated, chewed, absorbed, dissolved, inhaled, snorted, sniffed, or ingested by any other means, including, but not limited to a cigarette, cigar, little cigar, chewing tobacco, pipe tobacco, snuff, or snus; and
- Any Electronic Smoking Device, as defined in this Section 11.15.010, and any substances that may be aerosolized or vaporized by such device, whether or not the substance contains nicotine.
- 3. Notwithstanding the definitions set forth in subsections 1 and 2 to the contrary, "Tobacco Product" includes any component, part, or accessory of subsections 1 and 2, whether or not any of these contains tobacco or nicotine, including but not limited to filters, rolling papers, blunt or hemp wraps, hookahs, and pipes.
- 4. "Tobacco Product" does not include drugs, devices, or combination products authorized for sale by the United States Food and Drug Administration, as those terms are defined in the Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act.

Any substance containing tobacco leaf, including but not limited to cigarettes, cigars, pipe tobacco, hookah tobacco, snuff, chewing tobacco, dipping tobacco, bidis, or any other preparation of tobacco; and any product or formulation of matter containing biologically active amounts of nicotine that is manufactured, sold, offered for sale, or otherwise distributed with the expectation that the product or matter will be introduced into the human body. Except as otherwise provided herein, Tobacco Product does not include any

product specifically approved by the United States Food and Drug Administration for use in treating nicotine or tobacco dependence. For purposes of this Chapter, Tobacco Product includes an Electronic Smoking Device and Electronic Smoking Device Paraphernalia.

TOBACCO RETAILER. Any Person person who Sells sells, offers for Sale sale, or exchanges or does or offers to exchange for any form of consideration, in public view, tobacco, Tobacco Products or Tobacco Paraphernalia.

TOBACCO RETAIL ESTABLISHMENT. A fixed location at which tobacco, Tobacco Products and/or Tobacco Paraphernalia is sold, offered for sale, exchanged or offered for exchange for any form of consideration.

TOBACCO RETAILING The Selling selling, offering for Sale sale, or exchanging or offering to exchange for any form of consideration, in public view, tobacco, Tobacco Products or Tobacco Paraphernalia. Any person who distributes free or low cost samples of tobacco, Tobacco Products or Tobacco Paraphernalia shall be deemed to be a Tobacco Retailer under this Chapter. This definition is without regard to the quantity of Tobacco Products or Tobacco Paraphernalia sold, offered for Sale, exchanged, or offered for exchange.

TOBACCO RETAILER LICENSE. A license issued by the Department authorizing a Proprietor to engage in Tobacco Retailing.

VENDING MACHINE. A machine, appliance, or other mechanical device operated by currency, token, debit card, credit card, or any other form of payment that is designed or used for vending purposes, including, but not limited to, machines or devices that use remote control locking mechanisms.

SECTION 3. Section 11.15.015 of Chapter 11.15 of the Culver City Municipal Code is hereby amended to read as follows (<u>underlined text</u> denotes additions; strikethrough text denotes deletions):

§ 11.15.015 LICENSE REQUIREMENTS AND PROHIBITIONS.

- A. <u>License Required.</u> No person shall operate as a Tobacco Retailer or engage in Tobacco Retailing without first obtaining and maintaining a valid Tobacco Retailer License pursuant to this Chapter for each Tobacco Retail Establishment.
- B. <u>Display of License</u>. Each Tobaccó Retailer license shall be conspicuously displayed at all times in a publicly visible location within the licensed Tobacco Retail Establishment.
- C. <u>Self-Service Displays Prohibited.</u> Tobacco Retailing by means of a Self-Service Display is prohibited.
 - D. Sale of Flavored Tobacco Products Prohibited.
 - 1. It shall be a violation of this Chapter for any Tobacco
 Retailer or any of the Tobacco Retailer's agents or employees to Sell
 or offer for Sale, or to possess with intent to Sell or offer for Sale, any
 Flavored Tobacco Product.
 - 2. There shall be a rebuttable presumption that a Tobacco Retailer in possession of four or more Flavored Tobacco Products, including, but not limited to, individual Flavored Tobacco Products, Packages of Flavored Tobacco Products, or any combination thereof, possesses such Flavored Tobacco Products with intent to Sell or offer for Sale.
 - 3. There shall be a rebuttable presumption that a Tobacco Product is a Flavored Tobacco Product if a Tobacco Retailer,

Manufacturer, or any employee or agent of a Tobacco Retailer or Manufacturer has:

- a. made a public statement or claim that the Tobacco Product imparts a Characterizing Flavor;
- b. used text and/or images on the Tobacco Product's
 Labeling or Packaging to explicitly or implicitly indicate that the
 Tobacco Product imparts a Characterizing Flavor; or
- c. taken action directed to Consumers that would be reasonably expected to cause Consumers to believe the Tobacco Product imparts a Characterizing Flavor.
- <u>Sell</u> or transfer tobacco, a Tobacco Product or Tobacco Paraphernalia, to another <u>person</u> who appears to be under the age of 27 years, without first examining the identification of the recipient to confirm that the recipient is at least the minimum age under state law to purchase and possess the tobacco, Tobacco Product or Tobacco Paraphernalia.
- <u>EF.</u> <u>Restrictions on Persons Selling.</u> No Tobacco Retailer shall permit any person who is younger than the minimum age established by state law for the purchase or possession of tobacco, Tobacco Products or Tobacco Paraphernalia, to participate in the sale of tobacco, Tobacco Products or Tobacco Paraphernalia.
- FG. False and Misleading Advertising Prohibited. A Tobacco Retailer without a valid Tobacco Retail License or a Proprietor without a valid Tobacco Retailer License, including, for example, a Person whose license has been suspended or revoked:
 - 1. Shall keep all tobacco, Tobacco Products and Tobacco Paraphernalia out of public view. The public display of tobacco,

Tobacco Products and Tobacco Paraphernalia in violation of this section Section 11.15.015.F.1 shall constitute Tobacco Retailing without a Tobacco Retail License and a violation of Section 11.15.015.A of this Chapter.

2. Shall not display any advertisement relating to tobacco, Tobacco Products or Tobacco Paraphernalia that promotes the sale or distribution of such products from the Tobacco Retail Establishment or that could lead a reasonable consumer Consumer to believe such products can be obtained at the Tobacco Retail Establishment without the Tobacco Retailer first obtaining and maintaining a valid Tobacco Retailer License pursuant to this Chapter for each Tobacco Retail Establishment at which the advertisement is displayed.

On-Site Sales. The sale Sale of tobacco, Tobacco Products or GH. Tobacco Paraphernalia from other than a fixed location Tobacco Retail Establishment, including but not limited to Tobacco Retailing by persons on foot or from vehicles is prohibited and no Tobacco Retailer License shall be issued under this Chapter to any such activity. All Sales of Tobacco Products and Tobacco Paraphernalia to Consumers shall be conducted in-person at a Tobacco Retail Establishment. It shall be a violation of this Section 11.15.015.H for any Tobacco Retailer or any of the Tobacco Retailer's agents or employees to Deliver Tobacco Products or Tobacco Paraphernalia or to knowingly or recklessly Sell Tobacco Products or Tobacco Paraphernalia to any Person that intends to Deliver the Tobacco Product or Tobacco Paraphernalia to a Consumer in the City. For purposes of this subsection, "Deliver" means the commercial transfer of Tobacco Products or Tobacco Paraphernalia to a Consumer at a location not licensed pursuant to this Chapter.

22 ||///

23 | ///

24 ///

25 | / / /

26 ||///

27 ||///

I. Lawful Business Operation. In the course of Tobacco Retailing or in the operation and maintenance of the Tobacco Retail Establishment, it shall be a violation of this Chapter for a Tobacco Retailer Licensee, or any of the licensee's agents or employees, to violate any local, state, or federal law applicable to Tobacco Products, Tobacco Paraphernalia, or Tobacco Retailing.

HJ. <u>Application of State and Federal Law.</u> Nothing in this Chapter shall be construed to grant any person obtaining and maintaining a Tobacco Retailer License any status or right other than the right to act as a Tobacco Retailer at the licensed Tobacco Retail Establishment in the City of Culver City. Nothing in this Chapter is intended to be construed to render inapplicable, supersede, or affect any other provision of applicable state or federal law.

SECTION 4. Pursuant to Section 619 of the City Charter, this Ordinance shall take effect thirty (30) days after the date of its adoption. Pursuant to Sections 616 and 621 of the City Charter, prior to the expiration of fifteen (15) days after the adoption, the City Clerk shall cause this Ordinance, or a summary thereof, to be published in the Culver City News and shall post this Ordinance or a summary thereof in at least three places within the City.

-14-

1	SECTION 5. The City Council hereby declares that, if any provision, section,	
2	subsection, paragraph, sentence, phrase or word of this ordinance is rendered or declared	
3	invalid or unconstitutional by any final action in a court of competent jurisdiction or by	
4	reason of any preemptive legislation, then the City Council would have independently	
5	adopted the remaining provisions, sections, subsections, paragraphs, sentences, phrases	
6	or words of this ordinance and as such they shall remain in full force and effect.	
7		
8	APPROVED AND ADOPTED this _	day of, 2019.
9		
10		MEGHAN SAHLI-WELLS, Mayor
11		City of Culver City, California
12		en e
13	ATTEST:	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
14		Caller Sil
15	JEREMY GREEN, City Clerk	CAROL A. SCHWAB, City Attorney
16	A19-00628	
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		